

EMERGENCY 2007 CYCLONE RECOVERY AND RESTORATION PROJECT (ECRRP)

Component-E: Monitoring and Evaluation of Project Implementation Progress and Impact



SMEC International Pty Ltd., Australia

in
association
with



Development
Project Design &
Services Ltd.



ACE
Consultants
Ltd.

To
Mr. Md. Jahirul Islam, Ph.D
Director General/ Project Director,
ECRRP: PCMU,
Programming Division,
Planning Commission,
Ministry of Planning

Date : 07.06.12
Your Ref : Nil
Our Ref : ECRRP-M&E/248
Dealt by : DTL
Subject : **Compliance Status on 'Operational Specific Risk Mitigation Matrix' of ECRRP.**

Dear Sir,

As per our TOR and as per PAD of ECRRP, the M&E Consultants is to carryout independent monitoring of compliance by Project Implementing Agencies of 'Operational Specific Risk and Mitigation Matrix' identified by the WB Task Team at appraisal stage.

Accordingly, compliance status on the 'Operational Specific Risk Mitigation Matrix' of ECRRP has been prepared by us.

We are pleased to submit herewith statement on the compliance status for disposal.

With thanks and regards.

Sincerely yours,

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman
Acting Team Leader,
M&E Consultants, ECRRP-E

Encl.:- Statement on compliance status of 'Operational Specific Risk Mitigation Matrix' of ECRRP.

Copy with enclosure is forwarded for information and disposal to:-

1. Director General, Disaster Management Bureau, Component D.1, ECRRP, Dhaka.
2. Chief Technical Adviser, Component- A, ECRRP, FAO, Dhaka
3. Project Director, Component- B, LGED, ECRRP, Dhaka.
4. Project Director, Component- C, BWDB, ECRRP, Dhaka.
5. Ms. Reefat Sultana, Project Analyst, WB, Dhaka Office, Dhaka.

EMERGENCY CYCLONE RECOVERY AND RESTORATION PROJECT (ECRRP)

OPERATIONAL SPECIFIC RISK MITIGATION MATRIX OF ECRRP

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
<p><u>Component A</u></p> <p>Most affected communities are not properly identified.</p> <p>Communities already received assistance from other sources.</p> <p>Benefits and funds are captured by a few elites in the affected area</p>	<p>a) FAO will be engaged to lead the implementation of this component.</p> <p>b) FAO will coordinate geographical targeting, beneficiary selection criteria, nature of assistance and delivery mechanism</p> <p>FAO will coordinate these activities with the concerned staff of DAE, DOF and DLS.</p> <p>An Operational Manual will be prepared to ensure transparency.</p>	<p>a) FAO has been engaged since beginning of the Project to implement Component A. However, FAO took considerable time to appoint a full time Chief Technical Adviser.</p> <p>b) FAO is implementing Component A through Service Providers. For Livestock and Fisheries sub components, the Service Providers (SP) are selected and contracted with NGOs; for the crops sub component, DAE performs the role of SP.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NGOs identify and select poor and marginal farmers using PRA tools(Transact walk, Social Mapping and Wealth Ranking) and self identification and validation by beneficiary themselves. The final beneficiary lists are reviewed and approved by Upazilla (Livestock/Fisheries) Implementation and Rehabilitation Committees. - DAE field personnel identify and select beneficiary farmers and farmer groups. 	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>c) Beneficiaries will be identified and selected using eligibility criteria. Beneficiaries will be selected through community self identification and selection process. Beneficiaries may be listed publicly within each community.</p>	<p>Electronic data bases using Microsoft Excel Tables with unique identification of beneficiaries are being partially maintained.</p> <p>The implementation and progress of these activities are compiled in Section 2.3 “Component A Process and Progress Monitoring” of the M&E Consultant's (Component E) QPRs.</p> <p>A draft Operation Manual has been prepared by FAO. This is required to be finalized. FAO has not mentioned about the procurement methodology in the draft Operation Manual but has confirmed that WB procurement guidelines are followed by FAO. It should be mentioned in the Operation Manual.</p> <p>c) For Livestock and Fisheries, marginal and small beneficiaries are selected through PRA on self selection basis barring those who already received inputs from other sources. During the process of identification and selection, beneficiaries are interviewed and baseline information is collected. A beneficiary database has been established with unique identification no. with provision of records of inputs/ training interventions on individual beneficiary cards. For sub-</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
<p>Inadequate records and inventories of agricultural implements and goods provided to affected beneficiaries.</p>	<p>d) Activities to be carried out through existing ICM & IPM Clubs and those being established by SIPP.</p> <p>e) FAO's contract includes provision for design establishment of adequate inventory and record keeping system to keep track of agricultural goods and services provided to beneficiaries.</p>	<p>component A.1-Crops, the task is to be done by DAE.</p> <p>d) Project activities especially distributions of durable equipments are distributed to members of ICM / IPM Clubs, FFS established by the Project and to those established by SIPP. Individual beneficiaries are also given project interventions.</p> <p>e) The SP and DAE implement project activities maintaining adequate inventory and records for distributed inputs. Beneficiary ID card used by SPs of Livestock and Fisheries contain a record on inputs/training received by each beneficiary. Durable equipment such as Power Tillers, Low Lift Pumps, Batch Dryers are registered in legal deeds established in three copies (FAO, DAE, and Beneficiary Groups). Data on these are recorded in a data base. Tender Status and Progress in the Distribution of Agricultural Packages are reported in Section 2.3 "Component A Process and Progress Monitoring" of the M&E Consultant's (Component E) quarterly progress reports, and detailed in FAO's quarterly progress reports.</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>f) Independent M&E Consultants would carry out independent verification of assets and monitor and evaluate compliance with the inventory and record system on sample basis. M&E Consultants will also monitor community based need identification, targeting and delivering the inputs. The Consultants will provide regular feedback to FAO and PSC on major issues and recommend corrective actions.</p>	<p>f) Independent M&E Consultants has so far performed the task through field visits and discussion with the Agencies. Findings have been reported to PCMU, FAO and WB through field visit reports and periodical progress reports.</p> <p>Comprehensive compliance status on risk mitigation measures undertaken by the concerned Agencies have been prepared by the M&E consultants from an independent and unbiased perspective.</p>	
<p><u>Component B</u></p> <p><u>Component C</u></p> <p>Preparation of technical designs, bills of quantities & cost estimates, procurement of large civil works.</p> <p>Inadequate supervision and certification of designs, bills of quantities of completed works.</p>	<p>a) Both the Implementing Agencies have specialized and sound expertise in implementing such projects.</p> <p>b) Experienced Design and Supervision Consultants will be engaged to assist the two IAs in respect of carrying out engineering</p>	<p>a) Both BWDB and LGED are very specialized and experienced Government Organizations staffed with technically sound personnel to undertake and implement the assigned responsibilities.</p> <p>b) Design and Supervision Consultants have been engaged right from the beginning both for Component B: LGED and Component C: BWDB. DS Consultants for LGED is JV of</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
<p>Unsatisfactory quality control and adherence to procurement procedures</p>	<p>surveys, making designs, preparing bid documents, undertake responsibility for bid evaluation and award and construction supervision including quality assurance. Final certification of the quantity and quality compliance of works completed by contractors will also be responsibility of the DS Consultants who acts as “Engineer”.</p> <p>c) M&E Consultants will be responsible for overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation and will provide feedback to the PSC on the progress and implementation status of activities.</p> <p>d) M&E Consultants will also supervise implementation of overall EMF and S/RPF, carefully review and monitor sub-project specific social and environmental management plans, impact assessments and</p>	<p>Wilbur Smith Associates, USA and RPMC (BD) and that for BWDB is DDC in association with Euroconsult, Mott MacDonald, BCL and HCL. The Consultants are assisting the two IAs in respect of carrying out specific tasks and responsibilities.</p> <p>DS Consultants are also responsible to act as “Engineer” of civil works contracts. The tasks, responsibilities and obligations of PD, Executive Engineers and DS Consultants in respect of contract management should be clearly defined to make sure that the DS Consultants can properly act as ‘Engineer’.</p> <p>c) M&E Consultants is performing overall monitoring and evaluation of project implementation activities which are being focused through Field Visit Reports, Quarterly / Annual Progress Reports and other reports.</p> <p>d) M&E Consultants regularly review and advise improvements on LGED and BWDB Reports on assessment of environmental and social aspects relating to project interventions complying overall EMF and S/RPF, supervise and monitor sub-project</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	supervision of their implementation.	specific social and environmental management plans and their compliance during implementation.	
<p><u>Project Implementation, Co-ordination and Monitoring Capacity and Sustainability.</u></p> <p>Project interventions demand engagement of six agencies reporting five ministries. There is a risk that insufficient co-ordination & monitoring and evaluation will delay implementation and timely achievement of project objectives</p>	<p>a) Project implementation arrangements has been so designed that effective coordination among the multiple IAs and ministries will be ensured.</p> <p>b) FAO will be assigned as the lead implementation partner for Component A.</p> <p>c) Central PCMU will be established to oversee the overall project implementation.</p> <p>d) PSC would provide strategic and operational guidance to implementation agencies, oversee project progress & outputs/outcomes and resolve interagency and inter ministerial</p>	<p>a) Coordination among the multiple Implementation Agencies (IAs) and the WB is being effectively done by Project Coordination and Monitoring Unit (PCMU) established under the Planning Ministry.</p> <p>b) FAO has been assigned the role of lead implementation partner for Component A as a whole.</p> <p>c) Central PCMU has been established to oversee the overall coordination and monitoring of project implementation. PCMU is doing its job satisfactorily.</p> <p>d) Project Steering Committee (PSC) headed by the Secretary, Ministry of Planning provide strategic and operational guidance to the IAs, oversee project progress and outputs/ outcomes of project interventions and resolve interagency and inter ministerial</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>conflicts, if any.</p> <p>e) The independent M&E Consultants will carry out overall M&E of project progress, impacts and provide feedback to the PSC.</p> <p>f) Establishment of PCMU within the Planning Ministry to oversee and monitor such multi-disciplinary and multi-agency emergency project will build long term capacity of the Ministry.</p>	<p>conflicts through periodical PSC meetings.</p> <p>e) M&E Consultants carry out overall monitoring and evaluation of progress, impacts and provide feedback to the PSC through PCMU. This is being reflected in the Field Visit Reports, Quarterly / Annual Progress and other relevant Reports. Assessment of project impact compared to established Baseline Survey (conducted by M&E Consultants) statistics on pre-determined indicators will be taken up prior to Mid Term Review and will be reflected in the mid-term report. Individual IAs will also perform its individual impact assessment per Outcome-Output Matrix.</p> <p>f) Establishment of PCMU within Programming Division of the Planning Ministry to coordinate and monitor multi-disciplinary and multi-agency emergency project has definitely ensured building enhanced capacity of the Ministry.</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
<p><u>Procurement Risks</u></p> <p>Numerous fraud and corruption risks may arise in procurement administration due to non adherence to agreed procurement procedures and norms, poor transparency in the bidding process and disclosure of procurement related information.</p>	<p>a) Two international consulting teams will be assigned to BWDB and LGED to facilitate preparation of bidding documents, procurement administration for selection of civil works contractors, supervision and certification of all large civil works of Component B & C. All procurement under component A will be carried out by FAO.</p> <p>b) Appointment of an independent procurement expert attached to PCMU to assist PCMU and provide oversight function for the procurement under prior review</p>	<p>a) Associates of International and National Consulting firms have been assigned to BWDB and LGED who besides performing other tasks directly involve themselves in the procurement process of BWDB and LGED respectively to ensure transparency in the procurement process.</p> <p>FAO has been contracted for Component A to undertake responsibility for carrying out procurement in a transparent manner. FAO has confirmed that it follows PPR and WB guidelines in respect of all procurement under the Component.</p> <p>After a lapse of time, DMB has re-hired a new Procurement Specialist with effect from January 2012. The Procurement Specialist is however not a member of TEC of procurement packages of DMB. Procurement Specialist should be included as a member of TEC.</p> <p>b) The post of Procurement Specialist in PCMU has been dropped as per decision of the Planning Division. Both BWDB and LGED obtain no objection clearance of BERs of contract packages from WB as per</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>contracts of various implementation agencies that among others will include sample reviews of bidding documents, bid evaluation reports and post review reports for small value contracts.</p> <p>c) Provision of procurement consultants in the team of DS Consultants of BWDB and LGED; D&S Consultants of BWDB and LGED will act as “Engineer” for civil works contracts subject to prior review and the procurement consultants will be responsible to assist the agency on procurement related issues;</p> <p>d) Independent procurement expert (PCMU) participating in bid evaluation committees(BEC), preparing an oversight report on the overall procurement process,</p>	<p>procurement thresholds before issuing Notification of Award to selected contractors.</p> <p>c) Procurement Specialists have been engaged as member of DS Consultant teams of both BWDB and LGED who are involved in the bid evaluation process of the respective agencies. Besides, PD- BWDB has engaged one Individual Procurement Specialist to assist PD in Procurement related matters of Component C.</p> <p>DS Consultants are also responsible to act as “Engineer” of civil works contracts. The tasks, responsibilities and obligations of PD, Executive Engineers and DS Consultants in respect of contract management should be clearly defined to make sure that the DS Consultants can properly perform the role of ‘Engineer’ per Sub-Clause 2.1 - Engineer's Duties of FIDIC, Part-II.</p> <p>d) The post of Procurement Specialist in PCMU has been dropped as per decision of the Planning Division. Both BWDB and LGED obtain no objection clearance of BERs of contract packages (prior/ post review) from</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>include representative from D&S Consultant in all BECs of BWDB and LGED;</p> <p>e) Introduce procurement risk mitigation plan (PRMP) with a set of measurable performance monitoring indicators with provision of quarterly report by each implementing agency with the assistance of the independent procurement expert;</p> <p>f) Publication of procurement plan, bidding opportunities, contract award information, complaints and actions taken and procurement performance information in the website of CPTU and the concerned IAs;</p> <p>g) Post reviews on a semi-annual basis by an independent consultant hired by the Bank;</p> <p>h) Bank procurement team will orient and guide the procurement focal persons of all IAs;</p>	<p>WB before issuing Notification of Award to selected contractors.</p> <p>e) In the absence of independent procurement expert of PCMU, PRMP with a set of measurable performance indicators may be introduced by the procurement experts of each implementation agency taking guidance from the Bank procurement team, if necessary.</p> <p>f) The required information is made available by the IAs in the CPTU website.</p> <p>g) Two post reviews have been conducted by the Bank.</p> <p>h) Being done.</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	i) Bank team will guide and monitor establishment and maintenance of satisfactory procurement related record filing system etc.	i) Being done.	
<p><u>Financial Management Risks</u></p> <p>Overall FM risk is substantial due to limited prior working experience of IAs with Bank financed projects, weak internal FM capacities etc.</p>	<p>a) PCMU will include a full time, qualified and competent FM Specialist to oversee overall FM, Auditing and Disbursement Management of the project. Besides, all the IAs would be staffed with full time competent FM staff;</p> <p>b) Project specific comprehensive FM Manual will be developed based on manuals already developed by Bank. The project would also establish minimum benchmarks for the IAs to be able establish and comply with standard FM practices;</p> <p>c) Bank task team will carry out project specific FM and disbursement training to the IAs.</p>	<p>a) PCMU has a qualified full time FM Specialist who is performing his assigned tasks satisfactorily.</p> <p>All IAs except BWDB are staffed with full time FM staff. BWDB has FM staff headed by a part time specialist.</p> <p>b) Project specific comprehensive FM Manual based on manuals already developed by Bank is under preparation, it is stated.</p> <p>c) Bank has carried out specified training to the IAs.</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
<p><u>Social and Environmental Safeguard Risks</u></p> <p>Given the emergency approach and nature of project interventions, negative social and environmental impacts are negligible. However, environmental and social sustainability may be at risk if adequate measures are not incorporated in project design and implementation.</p>	<p>a) D&S Consultants will assist BWDB and LGED in the implementation of EMF and S/RPF;</p> <p>b) D&S Consultants will carry out site specific Environmental Assessments (EAs) and Social Assessments (SAs) and prepare Social Management Plans (SMPs) and Environmental Management Plans (EMPs) and Resettlement Action Plans (RAPs).</p> <p>c) Compliance of environmental safeguards will be facilitated and ensured by the M&E Consultants reporting directly to the PSC. The M&E Consultants will monitor implementation of the overall EMF and S/RAF as well as satisfactory compliance by contractors with sub-project specific EMPs, SMPs and RAPs;</p>	<p>a) Being complied.</p> <p>b) BWDB and LGED carry out site specific EAs and SAs, prepare SMPs and EMPs which are being reviewed, updated and recommended for clearance by the M& E Consultants.</p> <p>c) Review and necessary updating of Environmental Assessment Reports and Social Assessment Reports of contract packages prepared by the DS consultants of BWDB and LGED covering environmental and social safeguards aspects within the context of EMF and S/RPF are being done by the M&E Consultants.</p> <p>M&E Consultants also monitor the implementation of the EMPs, SMPs and RAPs which are reflected in the Field Visit Reports and periodical Progress Reports.</p>	

Identified Issues/ Risks	Suggested Mitigation Measures/ Mechanisms	Compliance Status of Mitigation Measures	Remarks
	<p>d) Bank task team would verify the quality of the overall safeguard compliance process and related risk mitigation plans. Satisfactory preparation of EMPs, SMPs and S/RAPs would be a condition of withdrawal of funds for each subproject and satisfactory completion of plans to be certified by the M&E Consultants will be a requirement for the release of final payments to contractors</p>	<p>d) Satisfactory preparation of EMPs, SMPs and S/RAPs of BWDB and LGED are being continuously reviewed and suggestion for up-gradation is given by the M&E Consultants. Compliance of agreed EMPs, RMPs and S/RAPs in the field should be given more emphasis. Payment relating to observance of EMPs, SMPs and S/RAPs has not yet been referred to M&E Consultants and no certification for final payment has yet been made.</p>	

A.H.M. Mahbubur Rahman

Acting Team Leader
M&E Consultants, ECRRP.